

Antedating headwords in the third edition of the OED: Findings and problems

Mirosława Podhajecka

University of Opole

The present paper describes problems involved in antedating headwords in the third edition of the Oxford English Dictionary (OED3). One of the elements in urgent need of revision in the previous edition was the dating of quotations but, despite the intensive labours of the lexicographers, some OED3 headwords and senses are still likely to be misdated. This paper is based on the premise that Google Books, a gigantic online resource, can be applied successfully for the verification of OED3 dating. Indeed, my findings indicate clearly that Google Books has a vast research potential, because half of the words in my sample (covering 129 items related to dancing) have been antedated in full-text sources. However, neither the search procedure nor the interpretation of data retrieved is straightforward, so a number of ambiguous and problematic examples have been provided to show that antedating is far more intricate than it seems at first sight. For example, one has to repeatedly distinguish between related senses, evaluate the relevance of similar word-forms and determine whether or not the words can be treated as fully-fledged loanwords. Even though many of my decisions were purely intuitive, I nonetheless hope that at least some of the antedatings found in Google Books turn out to be helpful for OED3 lexicographers in the on-going revision process.

1. Introduction

The present paper focuses on problems encountered in the process of antedating headwords in the *Oxford English Dictionary* (the OED). Collecting antedatings, that is, citations for words predating those currently listed in the dictionary, may be seen by laymen as little more than futile pedantry (McConchie 1997: 154). Yet to a lexicographer antedatings involve more than just mingling with the past: by indicating limitations of dictionaries they raise important questions of the consistency of editorial policies and the exhaustiveness and accuracy of dictionary material. No wonder this issue has been addressed in several major studies (e.g. Bailey 1978; Schäfer 1989; McConchie 1997) as well as in hundreds of papers tracing individual words, some of which are by-products of historical or linguistic research (e.g. Laski 1962; Siek 1978; Shapiro 1982; Lancashire 1996; Hough 2006; Kaislaniemi 2009). All of these studies, including critiques of the OED (e.g. Willinsky 1994), indicate in a consistent manner that a number of headwords in the first (OED1) and second (OED2) editions of the dictionary can be successfully predated.

Because of the patchy documentation of OED2, it was decided that the entire dictionary text would be revised from scratch, and this attempt to update all the previously published material, called ‘a task daunting and as ambitious as that originally undertaken by Murray and his fellow pioneers’ (Brewer 2007: 12), has been leading to the third edition (in progress, OED3). It is expected that, once thoroughly revised and corrected, OED3 will become a truly perfect repository of English vocabulary, but it seems that the new edition should also be carefully examined. My paper is based on the premise that the dating of OED3 headwords—one of many aspects worth investigating—can be verified by consulting Google Books, a gigantic online resource available at <http://books.google.com>. It should be mentioned, however, that I have been interested in antedatings rather than postdatings, though the latter are equally important for a diachronic dictionary.

As results from my study, inevitably limited in scope, Google Books offers to researchers amazing language data, including new usages, rare spellings and early attestations of words, and it has already proved to be a fertile ground for new discoveries. Still, Google Books is not a neat and tidy corpus of texts, so antedating does not mean excerpting a citation that will simply push back the date of the first recorded use of a word. On the contrary, one needs to

come to terms with some special search problems, such as incorrect metadata or poor quality of the optical character recognition (cf. Podhajecka in press), and differentiate between meanings or senses that are not always apparent from the context. This paper illustrates some of the complexities involved in the interpretation of search results.

2. Methodology and materials

To show the evolution of every headword, the OED provides dated citations, beginning with the earliest known usage, but lexicographers cannot usually be certain that the earliest known occurrence is undoubtedly its earliest usage, so they are always trying to find earlier evidence (Gold 2005: 30). In a way, antedatings have become the ‘holy grail’ of historical lexicography—they shed new light on the histories of words and are often essential for determining their true etymologies—but the process of gathering them is laborious, painstakingly slow and prone to failure. Therefore, while a great deal of antedatings must have been discovered by OED3 team in the course of the revision, many more are bound to appear in the future, when even greater volumes of texts become available and searchable electronically.

Speaking of the material used in my research, I worked with OED3, from which I selected a group of OED3 headwords so as to analyse the respective entries. The words under analysis pertain to dancing, which is a randomly-selected category; since dances have always been a vital element of cultural and social histories of nations, however, I predicted that they would be richly represented in texts. Next, I checked the dating of the headwords against Google Books, which was the most challenging part of my research; and the full list of Google Books sources can be seen in Appendix 1. As to the methodology pursued, the headwords come from the revised alphabet range (M-Q) of OED3. They were extracted automatically from the online edition by means of the ‘search in definitions’ function, ‘dance’ being used as the query keyword¹. This study has some chronological limits: since an overwhelming majority of Google Books texts come from the second half of the eighteenth century, to arrive at reliable results I excluded all the words or senses with the first attestation before 1750 (e.g. *minuet*, *Moll Peatley* or *planxty*), and I took into account nouns and nominative senses only.

The final research sample included 129 headwords, denoting primarily dances, dance movements and dance participants, which have been formed from native elements (e.g. *massive*, *one step*, *prom*) or are loanwords (e.g. *mambo*, *oberek*, *pogo*, *pwe*). In the case of the latter, foreign etyma were a valuable guide, but in the hunt for additional spellings I also relied on my intuition, which helped me discover word-forms unrecorded in OED3, such as *mazurek* / *mazourek* / *mazoorka* (OED3 *mazurka*), *Matchiche* / *Machiche* (OED3 *maxixe*), *Paduane* (OED3 *Paduan*) or *polsk* (OED3 *polska*)². The full list of words in my sample and their span of antedating can be seen in Appendix 2.

2.1. The *Oxford English Dictionary*

The *Oxford English Dictionary* is a historical dictionary that provides documentation for a vast range of English words from Old English to the present day. The first edition, originally

¹ Only a proportion of the examined headwords, e.g. *milonga*, *nayika*, *oberek*, *one-step*, *pas de deux*, *pastorale* or *phrasing*, are provided with the subject label ‘dance’, which suggests that labelling in OED3 has not been systematized as consistently as expected (cf. Brewer 2007: 245).

² While such instances may be regarded simply as misspellings, it seems that they too should be included into the dictionary if OED3 is to be treated as a fully descriptive dictionary.

called *A New English Dictionary on Historical Principles* and later renamed the *Oxford English Dictionary*, was first published in fascicles between 1884 and 1928 under the editorship of James Murray (cf. Mugglestone 2009)³. OED1 was followed by one-volume Supplement published in 1933, and several decades later four additional volumes of Supplement were edited by Robert Burchfield (1972–1986) with the aim of filling gaps discovered till then. In 1989 the whole dictionary material, including entries excluded by Burchfield and the three-volume *Oxford English Dictionary Additions Series* (1990–1997), was co-edited by John Simpson and Edmund Weiner as the second edition of the dictionary (OED2). The long-awaited electronic version came out in 1994, and in the same year plans for the new edition began to be formulated.

As has already been mentioned, a revision of OED2 is now under way (the draft entries in January 2010 being treated in the alphabet range M–R). Briefly speaking, it consists in seeking out countless numbers of new quotations, from a much wider range of texts than ever before, and drawing on scholarship published during the twentieth century and since (Brewer 2007: 11). Unsurprisingly, these efforts have greatly improved the entries, bringing changes to most aspects of the dictionary microstructure (e.g. etymologies, pronunciations, spelling variants, sense division, selection of citations or cross-references), and they have also helped enlarge its macrostructure (see, e.g. Durkin 2002; Simpson, Weiner and Durkin 2004; Weiner 2009). Even though OED3, compiled under the editorship of John Simpson, does not demonstrate a wider policy of inclusiveness, it integrates the words overlooked in the past as well as new vocabulary attested in English texts over the last decades (entries for new words and senses being published throughout the alphabet).

In contrast to their predecessors, OED3 lexicographers use not only collections of printed sources, mainly their own reading programme (conducted both in Britain and in the United States), but also numerous electronic corpora, lexical databases and the World Wide Web. Needless to say, what the lexicographers now have at their disposal are extensive and interrelated resources that, on the one hand, guide them through a tangled thicket of linguistic and lexicographic problems and, on the other one, help supplement the dictionary material with a wider range of data. The breadth of the materials and tools allowing their analysis has expanded so greatly since the publication of OED1 and OED2 that the quality of the revision can clearly be taken for granted. This indeed being so, the fact remains that some information categories in OED3 may be incomplete or outdated, because even rich documentation available to the lexicographers inevitably covers only part of the complex English resources produced, in different parts of the world and by native and non-native speakers alike, in the Modern English period. As long as all these texts are not found, mined and adequately preserved for future use, which actually sounds more like wishful thinking than a realizable endeavour, OED3 materials are likely to be fragmentary.

2.2. Google Books

The Google Books project, originally named Google Print, was embarked upon in 2005. It is an initiative seeking to make as much book content searchable online as is allowed by copyright law. At present the collection encompasses approximately 7 million books and is constantly growing, so it is easy to envisage that in the future it will include many more texts, both in English and in other world's languages. It covers two basic groups of materials: (1) texts in the public domain, which are out of copyright and are available for download, and (2) texts protected by copyright, available either in the form of text snippets (units of text that

³ There were five other editors of OED1: Herbert Coleridge, Frederick J. Furnivall, Henry Bradley, Charles T. Onions and William A. Craigie.

contain the query keywords) or unavailable. These sources come from a number of renowned public and university libraries, such as the Bodleian Library in Oxford, the Stanford University Library, University of Michigan Library or the Public Library of New York, whose holdings have been digitized by Google Corporation.

Google Books is operated by a standard search engine (cf. Miller 2006). To retrieve single words ('mosh'), expressions ('pole dance') or Boolean expressions ('milonga' AND 'tango') one can use simple search as well as advanced search, which offers additional search criteria (e.g. time span, language or specific text genres). The search engine provides hits to each query along with immediate context and bibliographic record (metadata). By clicking on the title of the source one obtains access to a full-text version or a snippet (in the case of sources protected by copyright access is rejected, which is a serious disadvantage), so what needs to be done is to make sure that the data has been properly sorted and interpreted.

3. Research findings and problems

In a nutshell, my research consisted of various permutations of the following steps: searching for variant spellings (those recorded in the dictionary and those anticipated), using different Boolean expressions to limit a large number of hits (e.g. 'phrase' AND 'dance', 'phrase' AND 'dancing', etc.), selecting different time spans⁴, checking the contexts for the right meaning, sifting through irrelevant search results and sorting legitimate citations chronologically. As to the results obtained, they can be classified as successful, because I have found antedatings for as many as 84 headwords or senses (which accounts for 65,1% of the research sample)⁵. Out of the data collected, 19 citations come from text snippets, which is rather flimsy and dubious evidence.⁶ Therefore, I decided to take into account the reliability factor and treated only 65 examples drawn from full-text versions as antedatings proper (50,4%). They have been collected in Appendix 3.

It is worthy of mention that while the average span of antedating is approximately 36 years, there are a handful of headwords (e.g. *marga*, *maypole dance*, *myal*, *pillow dance* or *punta*) that have been antedated by a hundred years or more. To show that the antedatings are not purely accidental, I collected, whenever possible, a few citations predating OED3 headwords (see the example below). They come from Google Books or, alternatively, from the Internet archive at <www.archive.org>, which allows the verification of a proportion of texts⁷. In Appendix 3 such verified headwords are marked by AT (short for 'archived texts').

Paul Jones

1920>1914	It may be like dancing the Paul Jones . The fun of the dance is the change of partners. The new one is not always better, but he's different: Sunset, 33
1920>1915	After Barn Dance is finished and dancers have rested, host or hostess announces a

⁴ To provide a specific example, for a word attested in, say, 1834, it is reasonable to use a relatively narrow time span first, e.g. 1830-1834, and then extend it to, e.g. 1750-1830. The time spans can be modified variously depending on how much one hopes to antedate the given headword.

⁵ If a headword has two 'dance' senses (e.g. *polka*, *matachin* or *mazurka*), I list any antedating that I have found.

⁶ These citations are shown in Appendix 4. It may be important to add that, if confirmed, some of them will probably turn out to be fully legitimate antedatings.

⁷ I am grateful to Professor Mark Davies of Brigham Young University for drawing my attention to the fact that texts which are not accessed from Google Books may still be available, though often in the form of raw text, from the website <http://www.archive.org/>

Section 6. Historical and Scholarly Lexicography and Etymology

- ‘**Paul Jones**’: Partners are again selected, and dance begins: Werner’s Readings and Recitations, 54
- 1920>1916 Then at the very last, when all the dancers joined in for the ‘**Paul Jones**,’ the magic whistle sounded as Allaine’s finger tips touched his. She half turned to dance with the man behind her, whose hand still grasped hers: The Van Haavens

Such instances are actually fairly frequent in Google Books, because at least two antedatings have been found in full-text sources for 49 headwords (38%). Notwithstanding this substantial evidence, a number of interpretative problems have to be solved. In most cases they result from the fact that determining the meanings of words in context (different kinds of semantic phenomena, such as vagueness, polysemy or ambiguity, come into play here) is by no means straightforward and requires broadly-defined lexicographic expertise. Rundell (2002: 146) remarks that at the interpretation stage ‘things can only get fuzzier’, and my experience as an amateur antedater fully supports this point of view.

Importantly, when it comes to the selection of illustrative material, OED3 lexicographers usually admit the most relevant citations—those which best illustrate the usage of a headword—but the first attestation does not have to describe meaning fully explicitly. Its main function is documentary, that is, it should be the earliest recorded evidence in line with the ‘historical principles’ that OED3 (and the earlier editions) is based on. Since Google Books is a substantial resource, with a little luck, one can find in it both genuine antedatings as well as citations that include the forerunners of words (e.g. items not recognized as English or not directly related to the given sense). The latter are often valuable evidence (cf. OED3 *mbaquanga*, *milonga*, *Nancy Dawson*, *nayaka*, etc.), but because they include merely lexical antecedents of the headwords, they are traditionally square-bracketed in OED3⁸.

For example, OED3 claims that *Macarena* ‘a dance consisting of set movements performed to a fast Latin rhythm’ has been directly inspired by a Venezuelan flamenco dancer of this name, yet Google Books provides additional evidence, in the light of which a traditional Spanish song played at bullfights, *la Macarena*, might also be more remotely connected to the dance name (see the first citation below).

Macarena

- 1995>1962 The newest refinements of London’s ‘Phase 4’ techniques provide ultra-realistic sound for brilliant renditions of ‘Granada,’ ‘Malaguena,’ ‘**Macarenas**,’ ‘Valencia,’ and a suite from ‘Carmen’: Billboard (June 23)
- 1995>1993 Some feel that when the innkeeper was alive, it was usually called **macarena**; others are of the view that it has been known as *laberinto* since the beginning: Studies in Dance History, 4(1)

4. Ambiguous contexts

A careful evaluation of the contexts aimed at ensuring consistency in meaning is an indispensable component of the search procedure; otherwise, one would be collecting incorrect evidence. Having said that, I have to admit that many passages are not at all transparent, particularly if they contain figurative devices, such as personification or metaphor. Speaking about the example below, the contextual clues (‘a double row’ and ‘face to face’) suggest that *money musk* denotes a dance, but it can as well be the name of a tune. However, since OED3 does not make a serious distinction between these two elements (‘a

⁸ Gold (2005: 35) calls such citations ‘foreshadowings’ but, as John Considine kindly tells me (email of 20 February 2010), the OED lexicographers’ preferred term has been ‘square-bracketed citations’.

kind of country dance for three couples in longwise sets. Also: the tune that accompanies this dance'), the following citation appears to be fairly useful as a source of antedating:

And I see the fiddler through the dusk, as he twangs the ghost of '**Money Musk**'!
The boys and girls in a double row, Wait face to face till the magic bow: Lady's Almanac (1785)

Even long samples of text do not always bring solutions to interpretative problems. For instance, seeking for *Macarena* (OED3 1993) I retrieved a full-text source published as early as 1905, but the context of the keyword was not very helpful in 'deciphering' the meaning. It was only a Boolean search ('Triana' AND 'Macarena') on the Web that made me realize the proper noun used in the passage below refers, metonymically, to inhabitants of one of the poor quarters of Seville.

At intervals there is a little venta, there are bowling-alleys, swings, barrel-organs, concertinas, the sound of castanets, people dancing, the clapping of hands, the cries of the vendors of water, shell-fish, and chestnuts, donkeys passing with whole families on their backs, families camping and picnicking on the grass, and everywhere chairs, chairs on the grass, two sitting on each chair, in a circle about the dancers, as they dance in couples, alternately; chairs and tables and glasses of manzanilla about the ventas; and always the slow movement of people passing, quietly happy, in a sort of grave enjoyment, which one sees in their faces when they dance. Here is the true pueblo of the working-people, *cigarreras*, gipsies, all Triana and the **Macarena**; and could people amuse themselves more simply or more quietly, with a more enjoyable decorum?: Cities by A. Symons (1905)

By and large, plenty of headwords in my list have homographic forms, such as toponyms or names of people, which inevitably slows down the search procedure. This is the case of *Macarena* (e.g. the Virgin of Macarena), *Madison* (e.g. Madison Square Garden), *Mambo*, *Manipuri*, *Nayaka*, *Orissi*, *Paul Jones*, *Paho*, *Parabasis*, *Punta*, etc.

Speaking of other puzzling citations in Google Books, they too include the word-forms but may not necessarily provide evidence for the given meanings. To provide a specific example, I found citations for two headwords, *pogo dance* 'a punk rock dance...' (OED3 1977/8) and *pole dance* 'any of various dances performed on or involving a pole; (now) *spec.* an erotic dance or striptease...' (OED3 1912), which could potentially antedate OED3 headwords:

Watching him describe a ballet, or do the **pogo dance** with the acrobatic Berry brothers, was a delight: New York Theatre Critics' Reviews (1944)
The **pole dance** in general closes the diversion of the afternoon; a dance so called from the production of a pole about ten feet high, and about four or five inches in circumference: A Narrative of the Expedition to the Rivers Orinoco and Apuré in South America... (1819)

Nonetheless, the interpretation of these citations poses challenges. More exactly, the first instance does not refer to punk rock and the second one pertains, somewhat unexpectedly, to a dance performed by South American Indians, but they are clearly evidence of usage predating OED3 quotations. It would perhaps be plausible to claim that we are dealing with diachronic semantic shift, but as not every sense has been included in OED3—the concept of frequency is apparently crucial here—such early attestations may, as it seems, be viewed by the lexicographers as largely irrelevant.

5. Dance terms or modified nouns?

The status of headwords in the light of dancing terminology is another category which is difficult to determine unequivocally. This refers to such dance names as *massive*, *old time*, *one step*, *modern (dance)* or *new beat*, which also have (or whose constituent elements have)

general meanings. For instance, *modern dance* ‘a free expressive style of dance developing in the early 20th cent. as a counter to classical ballet. Also a category of ballroom dance’ (OED3 1933) is found in numerous texts, because any dance can be classified, under specific circumstances, as a modern dance. In other words, this general usage reflects a collocational pattern that refers not only to the twentieth century but also to earlier periods, as has been illustrated below:

He seems to think, that the natural love of a measured Melody, in time, threw the gesture into Dance; and, indeed, this opinion appears very probable, when only the **modern Dance**, which is correspondent to Melody, is considered: *The Monthly Review; Or Literary Journal...*, 29 (1763)
WALTZ. (German) The name of a **modern dance** much used in Germany. The measure of its music is *triple*: three quavers in a bar: *A Complete Dictionary of Music, to Which is Prefixed, a Familiar Introduction...*, 3rd ed. (1811)
 True, we still have the monotonous soporific quadrille, as if to remind us of bygone times; but the true **modern dance** is the round dance, which differs from the stately mediaeval dance as a jolly rural picnic does from a formal morning call: *Romantic Love and Personal Beauty: Their Development, Casual Relations, Historic...* (1891)

Establishing the historical background of the usage is thus of primary importance, but it is not always easy, especially when OED3 definitions are imprecise. It seems that adding more encyclopedic information might provide users and researchers with valuable clues in the cases of textual ambiguity, all the more because OED3 citations for some headwords (e.g. *modern dance*) are not particularly illuminating.

As to formal requirements, sometimes the word ‘dance’ is modified by another noun (e.g. *maypole* in *maypole dance*), whereas in other cases (e.g. *nautch* / *nautch dance*) such attributive usage is apparently optional⁹. Less frequent are entries in which the dance name is treated as a shortening (e.g. *modern* ‘short for *modern dance*’)¹⁰. However, one might wonder to what extent OED3 treatment has been fully consistent. For example, the earliest quotation illustrating *mazy* ‘a dance in which the dancers move in intricate patterns’ suggests that it was introduced by Dickens in his ‘Old Curiosity Shop’ (1841). As has turned out, there are two instances of *mazy* in that novel: ‘the windings of the mazy’ and ‘as she moved through the mazy dance’, so it would perhaps be judicious to treat *mazy* as a shortening of *mazy dance*. Still, in spite of the fact that Google Books evidence for *mazy dance* has been extensive, many contexts in which it occurs are admittedly vague.

6. Homonymy and polysemy

The fuzzy borderline between homonymy and polysemy stems from difficulties in discriminating meaning. As is well known, in present-day dictionaries meanings are divided into senses on the basis of huge volume of text, whose reliability has been proved by corpus linguists and lexicographers over the last few decades (cf. Sinclair 1991)¹¹. Still, a dictionary based on a corpus of citations is confined to the evidence of that corpus only, hence any new documentation can enhance the existing sense division, but it can also raise thought-provoking questions. By pointing to my findings and problems, I want to underline that, even

⁹ Compounds in OED3 are entered consistently in the Compounds section of relevant entries, but *monkey dance* and *pipe dance* are given the status of main headwords.

¹⁰ Interestingly, in OED3 *old-time* is not treated as a shortening and *old time dance* as a compound, even though there is evidence for both usages in Google Books.

¹¹ Using textual data to divide meanings into senses is not a new method, as was shown by the working practices of such renowned lexicographers as Samuel Johnson (cf. Landau 2001: 60-66).

in the era of technological advancement that allows greater automation of the dictionary-making process than ever before, selecting and classifying material that goes into the dictionary inevitably requires intuitive, and hence subjective, decisions.

Obviously, one can easily differentiate between formally convergent forms with different meanings and origins in OED3, inasmuch as they are treated as separate headwords. To provide a practical example, the words *matachin 1* and *matachin 2*, as described in the dictionary, are not only of different provenance, but they also denote two different concepts first referred to in the sixteenth and nineteenth centuries, respectively:

matachin 1

1.a. A 16th-cent. sword dance related to the morris dance, performed by dancers in extravagant costume and representing a fight or duel. [...] **3.** A person who dances in a matachin. **1591** J. HARRINGTON tr. L. Ariosto *Orlando Furioso* VI. lxi. 45/2 Monstrous of shape and of an ugly hew, Like masking Machachinas all disguised.

matachin 2

1. Chiefly in Central America and the south-western United States: a person or character who takes part in a ritual dance based on the history of Montezuma II. Chiefly in *pl.* **1876** *Scribner's Monthly* Mar. 654/1 One of the band-men was sent out to bring in a party of dancers..who would show a pure Mexican dance to the visitors. This was the dance of the Matachines,—which dates back even to the Court of Montezuma. Freq. in *pl.*, with *sing.* concord. The ritual dance performed by matachin dancers.

In practice, the semantic distinction is sometimes hard to see. Let us take an example (shown below) to illustrate this hypothesis: the meaning of the word *matachine*, which pertains both to Italian dancers (apparently sense 3 of *matachin 1*) and Montezuma dancers (apparently sense 1 of *matachin 2*), cannot be disambiguated clearly:

One division of the city was entirely inhabited by Montezumas dancers and posture-makers; some of whom danced like those Italians whom we call **Matachines**; others played various tricks by means of sticks which they balanced in many curious ways; and others had a strange manner of flying in the air: A General History and Collection of Voyages and Travels, Arranged in Systematic Order... (1812)

Distinguishing between different senses of polysemous words may be equally troublesome. For example, OED3 includes two distinct senses of *mazurka* ('a lively country dance in triple time...' and 'a piece of music intended to accompany such a dance...'), and among the senses of *phrasing* two are likewise related to music ('the rendering of musical phrases') and dance ('the linking of movements in a choreographic sequence'). Still, despite the fact that finding evidence for these word-forms in Google Books was not difficult, assigning them unambiguously to the given senses was much harder.

I shall never forget the pretty sprightly *Shenkerka* (barmaid) at Gdov, nor the grace with which she led us, her two evening guests, to the dance, a gay **Mazurka**, played by two Slovaks. Nothing can be more pretty or graceful than Polish girls when dancing: Austria, Vienna, Hungary, Bohemia and the Danube, Galicia, Styria, Moravia... (1843)

Rhythm, notation, marks of expression, and musical embellishments are fully illustrated. Musical form is next analyzed and traced to an origin in the old dances. The *suite* was 'at first a set of dance movements. In a study of figures and **phrasing**, the author points out that the leit-motif so characteristic of Wagner was first used by Mozart in Don Giovanni: The Popular Science Monthly (1891)

The passages cited above show that obscure contexts may, and often do, render it impossible to draw a clear line between intertwined senses. Particularly when references to two or more semantic domains are found in one passage, one has to decide carefully which sense, and based on what criteria, should be given prominence.

It is worthwhile mentioning what Simpson (2000) says overtly about problems faced by historical lexicographers. In his words, any extensive examination of documentary evidence is bound to uncover idiosyncratic examples of usage (e.g. overlapping meanings of a word), often in ways which would be impractical for the dictionary to illustrate. If one assumes that Google Books is documentary evidence, as is clearly the case, the effects of such examination become self-explanatory: semantic categorization in OED3 should be seen as imposed by the lexicographers—having been first selectively simplified—rather than neatly sorted on the basis of historical material. Nonetheless, the idea that all evidence (some of it complementary and some contradictory) might be synthesized into consistent dictionary text is, at least at this stage in lexicographical development, neither feasible nor desirable (cf. Piotrowski 2009: 200–201).

7. Lexicographic treatment

The classification of word-forms in OED3, presumably done on the basis of textual and historical evidence like many other dictionary-making procedures, is another quandary to be addressed. For example, two headwords presented below, *pastourelle* (?1814) and *pastorale* (1845), illustrate differences in lexicographic treatment: in one entry the words are viewed as synonymous, whereas in the other one they are merely analogues (items introduced by ‘cf.’)¹²:

pastorale, *n.* 2. *Dance.* = **PASTOURELLE** *n.* 1. *Obs. rare.*

pastourelle, *n.* *Dance.* One of the figures of a quadrille, likened to a dance of shepherds and shepherdesses. Cf. **PASTORALE** *n.* 2. Now *hist.*

Discovering the true nature of the relationship between the headwords may be problematic for antedaters, particularly when one comes across *pastoral dance*, which is some sort of an ‘intermediary’ form. Interestingly, despite having a high frequency in Google Books, *pastoral dance* has not been admitted (rightly or wrongly?) into OED3.

To point out another example of controversial treatment, *partridge dance* covers two senses ‘a courtship display among partridges’ and ‘a North American Indian dance inspired by the partridge’, yet OED3 does not distinguish between them in the quotations section. If the earliest citation illustrating sense 1 is 1871 and that for sense 2 is 1947, does it mean that one should search for antedatings in this order? By contrast, *pipe dance* has also been described as having two senses, but this time each of them is properly illustrated with a separate batch of citations. Even though this dissimilar treatment apparently reflects the relative importance of the examined headwords—unlike *partridge dance*, *pipe dance* is given the status of main headword—it does not signify a consistent lexicographic policy.

In a different vein, OED3, as an historical dictionary, arranges senses chronologically, that is, a sense documented earlier is entered before one attested later. However, it seems that the ordering of senses in a proportion of OED3 entries can be questioned. This has been noticed in the case of *mambo*, whose two senses are dated to 1948 (‘a modified form of rumba, of Latin American origin’) and 1964 (‘a voodoo priestess’). Having found no relevant texts that could help me antedate sense 1, I still came across materials suggesting that sense 2 had been recorded earlier than sense 1.

¹² Two other headwords, *oberek* and *obertas*, have been given equally dissimilar treatment in OED3.

mambo

- 1964>1939 He smoked a cigar, and in his free hand held a bottle of rum. The drums began again on a signal from the *houngan*, and the visiting *mambos* ('priestesses') and *houngans*...: Haiti Singing
- 1964>1952 And so on that first visit I met not only a mambo (priestess) but a houngan (priest) as well: Haiti: Highroad to Adventure

8. Headword status: foreignism or loanword?

Determining the lexical status of words is another problem one has to cope with. As many texts, primarily Latin and French, had for centuries been translated into English, a number of exoticisms were transferred from the original versions. One of many interesting examples, *dance macabre*, comes directly from the French source entitled 'La dance macabre' (cf. OED3 *dance of Macabre*). The question to be asked at this juncture is: can a citation referring somewhat sloppily (the French indefinite article *la* is dropped) to the French title be regarded as the earliest usage in English? Depending on the adopted criteria, this item may be antedated variously, as shown below:

- copy of the **dance macabre**: The Bibliographical Decameron (1817)
... each cut of the **Dance Macabre** contains four figures, viz. two of Death and two of personages he is addressing: A Journey Round the Library of a Bibliomaniac... (1821)
This edition has sometimes the **Dance Macabre** annexed to it, to which is attached the date of 1554: Catalogue of the Curious, Choice and Valuable Library... (1836)

Another thorny issue, closely related to the one mentioned above, is when exactly a lexical item starts to be treated as a stable element of the English vocabulary, that is, a loanword rather than a foreignism. For instance, the earliest attestation of *ngoma* 'a dance to the music of a drum ...' has been found in English texts in its apparently unnaturalized form (see the first example below)¹³:

- At the **Ngoma Ku**, or great dance, which celebrates every event in these realms of revelry, only the Diwans may perform the morris with drawn swords before the admiring multitudes: The Journal of the Royal Geographical Society in London, 29 (1859)
In the town of Zanzibar these '**Ngoma**' or dances were prohibited for moral reasons by the late Sayyid: The Lake Region of Central Africa: A Picture of Exploration (1860)
Friday, the Muhammadan Sabbath, is often devoted by the slaves to their **Ngoma** (dances): Life, Wanderings, and Labours in Eastern Africa: With an Account... (1873)

However, as they become widespread, foreignisms tend to lose their 'local colour' (called otherwise 'foreign flavour' or 'foreign feel') and are fully or partly integrated into the borrowing language, in this way acquiring the status of loanwords. This must have indeed been the case here, because the value of the next two citations is not debatable. In consequence, the earliest attestation deserves to be incorporated into the entry *ngoma* as a square-bracketed citation.

9. Conclusions

In order to antedate OED3 headwords with Google Books one has to go manually through a number of sources, devoting much time to the interpretation of vague and ambiguous contexts. Regardless of the effort involved in it, such research can also be extremely gratifying, because finding any antedatings for OED3 headwords, so meticulously revised by a team of well-trained lexicographers, must be seen as a genuine success. The fact that

¹³ Interestingly, in the same textual source one can also find an assimilated form of the word (cf. Appendix 3).

antedatings have been discovered for half of my research sample is a clear-cut proof that despite its deficiencies Google Books has enormous—and still unexploited—potential for improving the dictionary's dating of words. Obviously, the results of this cursory study do not have to be taken as statistically significant, but its implications are in fact broader than originally assumed. More precisely, changes in the dating, if ultimately confirmed, may require changes in OED3 sense arrangement, which calls for a comprehensive verification of all citations illustrating headwords.

Speaking of the standards in antedating research, Gold (2005: 38) argues that antedatings can be sought even by 'people with little training in linguistics, as long as they are honest and intelligent'. In this perspective, it is not surprising that McKean (2007) speaks of a vast cadre of 'DIY word-researchers' who, stimulated by their own personal interests, keep updating the OED headwords. Most of the researchers apparently have no expertise in practical lexicography, so the final decisions on whether or not the collected antedatings will be considered or admitted into the dictionary belong to the lexicographers. As far as the present study is concerned, many of my own decisions were purely intuitive, but I hope that at least some evidence presented in this paper turns out to be helpful, either as antedatings proper or square-bracketed citations, in the on-going revision of OED3.

It goes without saying that antedatings can be pursued for a number of reasons. Whatever the actual objectives, there is one more important argument behind undertaking time-consuming searches: satisfaction that more and more headwords in OED3 will be described accurately for the benefit of future generations of users. Having always regarded the *Oxford English Dictionary* as an unsurpassed guide to the history of English vocabulary, I believe that individual scholars, including non-native ones like myself, should try their hand at contributing, in one way or another, to its qualitative and quantitative data.

References

- Bailey, R. W. (ed.) (1978). *Early Modern English: Additions and Antedatings to the Record of English Vocabulary 1475-1700*. New York: Georg Olms Verlag.
- Brewer, C. (2007). *Treasure-House of the Language. The Living OED*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Durkin, P. (2002). 'Changing Documentation in the Third Edition of the *Oxford English Dictionary*: Sixteenth-Century Vocabulary as a Test Case'. In Fanego, T.; Méndez-Naya, B.; Seoane, E. (eds.). *Sounds, Words, Texts and Change. Selected Papers from 11 ICEHL*, Santiago de Compostela, 7-11 September 2000. Amsterdam: John Benjamins. Vol. II. 65-81.
- Gold, D. L. (2005). '[An Aspect of Lexicography Still Not Fully Professionalized: The Search for Antedatings and Postdatings \(With Examples Mostly from English and Some from Other Languages\)](#)'. In *Revista Alicantina de Estudios Ingleses*, 18. 25-69. [Access date: 6 Feb. 2010].
- Hough, C. A. (2006). 'An Antedating of the OED Entry for 'Windmill''. *Notes and Queries* 53(1), 30-31.
- Kaislaniemi, S. (2009) '["Jurabassos" and "Linguists": The East India Company and Early Modern English Words for "Interpreter"](#)'. In McConchie, R. W.; Honkapohja, A.; Tyrkkö, J. (eds.). *Selected Proceedings of the 2008 Symposium on New Approaches in English Historical Lexis (HEL-LEX2)*. Somerville, MA: Cascadilla Proceedings Project. 60-73. [Access date: 6 Feb. 2010].
- Lancashire, I. (1996). '[An Early Modern English Dictionaries Corpus 1499-1659](#)'. In CHWP B.17. [Access date: 4 Feb. 2010].
- Landau, S. I. (2001). *Dictionaries. The Art and Craft of Lexicography*. 2nd ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Laski, M. (1962). 'Antedatings of O.E.D. in *Evelina*'. *Notes and Queries* 9 (August 1962), 269-70.
- McConchie, R. W. (1997). *Lexicography and Physicke: The Record of Sixteenth-Century English Medical Terminology*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- McKean, E. (2007) '[What Came First: The Competitive Sport of "Antedating"](#)'. In *The Boston Globe*, October 14. [Access date: 6 Feb. 2010].
- Miller, M. (2006). *Googlepedia: The Ultimate Google Resource*. Indianapolis, IN: Que.
- Mugglestone, L. (2009). 'The Oxford English Dictionary'. In Cowie, A. P. (ed.). *The Oxford History of English Lexicography*. Vol. I. General Purpose-Dictionaries. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 230-259.
- OED3. [The Oxford English Dictionary Online](#). 3rd ed., J. Simpson (ed.). Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000-. [Access date: 12 Feb. 2010].
- Piotrowski, T. (2009). 'Annoyed Because of Eternity. Approximate and Exact Historical Lexicography'. In Wolny, R. W. (ed.). *On Time: Reflections on Aspects of Time in Culture, Literature and Language*. Opole: Uniwersytet Opolski. 197-203.
- Podhajecka, M. (in press). 'Research in Historical Lexicography: Can Google Books Collection Complement Traditional Corpora?' In Lewandowska-Tomaszczyk, B. (ed.). *PALC 2009: Practical Applications in Language and Computers*. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang.
- Rundell, M. (2002). 'Good Old-Fashioned Lexicography: Human Judgement and the Limits of Automation'. In Corr  ard, M.-H. (ed.). *Lexicography and Natural Language Processing. A Festschrift in Honour of B.S.T. Atkins*. EURALEX 2002. G  teborg: G  teborg University.
- Sch  fer, J. (1989). *Early Modern English Lexicography*. Vol. I. A Survey of Monolingual Printed Glossaries and Dictionaries 1475-1640. Vol. II. Additions and Corrections to the OED. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Shapiro, F. (1982). 'Antedatings from Malte-Brun's *Universal Geography (1822)*'. *Notes and Queries* 29: 232.
- Siek, W. H. (1978). "'Pause': An Antedating of O.E.D'. *Notes and Queries* 25(5), 445.
- Simpson, J. A (2000). '[Distractions](#)'. Preface to the Third Edition. [Access date: 22 Feb. 2010].
- Simpson, J. A.; Weiner, E.S.C.; Durkin, P. (2004). 'The *Oxford English Dictionary* Today'. In *Transactions of the Philological Society* 102(3), 335-381.
- Weiner, E. (2009). 'The Electronic OED: The Computerization of a Historical Dictionary'. In Cowie, A. P. (ed.). *The Oxford History of English Lexicography*. Vol. I. General Purpose-Dictionaries. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 378-409.

Section 6. Historical and Scholarly Lexicography and Etymology

Willinsky, J. (1994). *Empire of Words: The Reign of the OED*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Appendix 1: Internet sources <http://books.google.com>

- Adventures in Search of a Living in Spanish-America (1911) [AT]
 Advertiser Notes and Queries, 1 (1881) [AT]
 Africa from Port to Port (1931)
 The Ancient History of the Egyptians, Carthaginians [&c.], 4, 11th ed. (1808)
 An Argument for a National Bureau of Insurance Submitted to the Insurance Companies (1879) [AT]
 The Arrow of Pi Beta Phi, 69, 3rd ed. (1953)
 The Art of Dancing Explained by Reading and Figures: Whereby the Manner of Performing the Steps is Made Easy... (1735)
 The Asiatic Journal and Monthly Register for British and Foreign India, China, and Australasia, 37 (New Series) (1842)
 Asiatick Researches: Or Transactions of the Society, Instituted in Bengal..., 3 (1792)
 The Atheneum; Or, Spirit of the English Magazines Comprehending... (1823)
 Austria, Vienna, Hungary, Bohemia and the Danube, Galicia, Styria, Moravia... (1843)
 Ballou's Monthly Magazine, 53 (1831)
 Belhaven Tales: Crow's Nest; Una and King David (1892) [AT]
 Bentley's Miscellany, 9 (1841)
 The Bibliographical Decameron (1817)
 Billboard, 58(39) (1946)
 Billboard (June 23, 1962)
 Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 34 (1833)
 Blue Roses; Or, Helen Malinofska's Marriage, 2nd ed. (1877)
 A Book for Shakespeare Plays and Pageants (1916) [Reprint 2005]
 Catalog of Copyright Entries, part 3, 21(1) (1927)
 Catalogue of the Curious, Choice and Valuable Library... (1836)
 The Censor, 2 (1717)
 Chinese Digest: Official Organ of the Chinese Cultural Society of America, 1-2 (1935)
 Cities by A. Symons (1905)
 A Classical Dictionary of India: Illustrative of the Mythology, Philosophy, Literature, Antiquities... (1871) [AT]
 Comedies of Aristophanes. VIZ: The Clouds, Plutus, the Frogs, the Birds, Translated into English: With Notes (1812)
 A Complete Dictionary of Music, to Which is Prefixed, a Familiar Introduction..., 3rd ed. (1811)
 The Critical Review: Or, Annals of Literature, 60 (1785)
 Cultural Policy in the United Republic of Cameroon (1976)
 Current opinion, 47 (1909)
 Dancing and Its Relations to Education and Social life: With a New Method of Instruction (1900)
 The Diaboliad: A Poem (1677)
 A Dialogue on Taste, 2nd ed. / The Investigator: Containing the Following Tracts (1762)
 Ebony, 15(9) (1960)
 The Emperor Marcus Antoninus. His Conversation with Himself, 1st ed. (1701)
 Encyclopaedia Metropolitana: Or Universal Dictionary of Knowledge... (1845)
 An Encyclopaedia, Or Dictionary of Music ... (1818)
 Evergreen Review, 11(45) (1967)
 From Adam's Peak to Elephanta: Sketches in Ceylon and India (1892) [AT]
 A General History and Collection of Voyages and Travels, Arranged in Systematic Order... (1812)
 A General History of the Science and Practice of Music, 1 (1853)
 The Gentleman's and London Magazine: Or Monthly Chronologer, 1741-1794 (1778)
 The Girl Delinquent and the Male Street Corner Gang Report (1961)
 Glossographia Anglicana Nova: Or, A Dictionary, Interpreting Such Hard Words... (1707)
 Haiti: Highroad to Adventure (1952)
 Haiti Singing (1939)
 The Harmonicon, part 1 (1830)
 The Hermit in Italy, Or Observations on the Manner and Customs of Italy..., 1 (1825)
 An Historical Sketch of the Sanscrit Literature (1832)
 The History of Jamaica (1774)
 How to Write Short Stories (with Samples) (1924)
 Illustrations of Shakespeare, and of Ancient Manners (1839)
 Indian and Foreign Review, 5 (1947)
 Jet (June 27, 1963)
 Journal of the American Oriental Society, 7 (1862)
 The Journal of the Royal Geographical Society in London, 29 (1859)
 A Journey Round the Library of a Bibliomaniac... (1821)
 Lady's Almanac (1785)
 The Lake Region of Central Africa: A Picture of Exploration (1860)
 The Land and the Lingam (1933)
 The Land of the Castanet: Spanish Sketches (1896) [AT]
 Life, Wanderings, and Labours in Eastern Africa: With an Account... (1873)
 Lok Sabha Debates (1881)
 The London Magazine, Charivari, and Courier des Dames... (1840)
 Lost in a Great City (1880) [AT]

Section 6. Historical and Scholarly Lexicography and Etymology

Merton, and the Sutherlands (1800)
 The Method of Teaching and Studying the Belles Lettres: Or, An Introduction to Languages ... (1737)
 The Mirror of Literature, Amusement, and Instruction: Containing Original Essays..., 12 (1828)
 Miss George Anna Reinagle: Music Book for Fancy Tunes (1825) [Confirmed in Bibliographic Guide to Dance: 1981]
 The Monthly Review; Or Literary Journal..., 29 (1763)
 Musical Standard, 18 (1902)
 The Nāga Tribes of Manipur (1911) [AT]
 A Narrative of the Expedition to the Rivers Orinoco and Apuré in South America... (1819)
 Narrative of the Voyage of H. M. S. Herald During the Years 1845-51 (1853)
 Never Enough: A Novel (1932)
 New York Theatre Critics' Reviews (1944)
 Old Curiosity Shop (1841)
 Pace: Process & Control Engineering (July, 1989)
 Peculiarities (1891)
 The Popular Science Monthly (1891)
 Present State of the Spanish Colonies, 1 (1810)
 The Republic of Mexico in 1876: A Political and Ethnographical Division of the Population, Character... (1876) [AT]
 Revelations of Spain, in 1845, By an English Resident, 1 (1845)
 Romantic Love and Personal Beauty: Their Development, Casual Relations, Historic... (1891)
 A Russian Proprietor and Other Stories (1887) [AT]
 The Scourge; Or Monthly Expositor, of Imposture and Folly (February 1, 1811)
 Sketches of India: With Notes on the Seasons, Scenery, and Society of Bombay... (1750)
 The Sporting Magazine, Or Monthly Calendar of the Transactions of the Turf, the Chase, and Every Other Diversion, 30 (1808)
 The Story of Helena Modjeska, (Madame Chlapowska) (1883) [AT]
 Studies in Dance History, 4(1) (1993)
 Sunset, 33 (1914)
 Temple Bar: A London Magazine for Town and Country Readers, 66 (1882)
 The Theatrical Times, A Weekly Magazine of Thespian Biography..., 3 (1848)
 Their Day in Court (1909) [AT]
 The Van Haavens (1916)
 The Visit of the Prince of Wales, a Chronicle of His Royal Highness's Journeyings in India... (1876)
 The Voyage to the Cape of Good Hope, Towards the Antarctic Polar Circle, and Round the World... (1786)
 Werner's Readings and Recitations, 54 (1915)
 A Woman's Paris: A Handbook of Every-day Living in the French Capital (1900) [AT]
 A Year in the Andes; Or, A Lady's Adventures in Bogotá (1882)
 The Young Voyagers, Or the Boy Hunters in the North (1857)

Appendix 2: List of examined OED3 headwords and span of antedating

OED headword	Span of antedating	OED headword	Span of antedating	OED headword	Span of antedating
macabre	1851>1841	Nancy Dawson	1766	pasillo	1885>1882
Macarena	1995>1993	Nataraja	1910>1892	paso doble	1927>1896
Madison	1962>1960	natya	1835>1832	pas seul	1786
makossa	1985>1976	nautch	1789>1750	pastorale	1845>1818
malagueña	1853>1810	nautch dance	1825>1800	pastourelle	?1814
mambo	1948>1946	nayaka	1967>1933	pata-pata	1961
Manipuri	1957>1911	nayika	1948>1871	Paul Jones	1920>1914
marabi	1933	New Beat	1988>1967	peace walk	1915
marga	1956>1862	ngoma	1905>1859	pedestal dance	1895>1880
marinera	1926>1911	Noh	1871	Perigourdine	1880>1825
massive	1989	Northern Soul	1971	Petronella	1843>1828
matachin 2	1876>1812	notation	1920>1845	phrase	1925>1900
matelote	1785	notator	1896>1853	phrasing	1952>1916
matric dance	1972	nritta	1835>1833	pigeon wing	1807
Maxina	1917	nritya	1835>1792	pillow dance	1909>1811
maxixe	1914>1909	oberek	1938>1883	pipe dance	1778
maypole dance	1870>1717	obertas	1889>1877	plait dance	1887>1876
mazurka	1854>1830	Odissi	1965>1881	plantation dance	1860>1848
mazy	1841>1677	old time (dance)	1909>1892	pogo	1978>1953
mbaqanga	1964	ole	1846>1845	poi	1817
mbube	1948	one-step	1911>1909	polacca	1804
meat market	1896	orchestic	1847>1808	pole dance	1912>1819
Medicine dance	1805	Orissi	1960>1947	polka	1843>1825

mento	1910	ork	1936>1935	polo 2	1883>1830
merengue	1888	Ouled Nail	1881>1879	polska	1849>1823
Mess Around	1946>1927	pachanga	1956	pony	1962>1961
milonga	1914	Paduan	1880>1839	pop	1862
mine dance	1939>1931	paho	1884	pose	1845>1840
modern (dance)	1933>1891	palais	1928	position	1778>1735
Molly dancer	1903>1881	palais (de dance)	1913>1900	prisiadka	1938>1887
money maker	1961	palais glide	1936	production number	1926>1924
money musk	1792>1785	pantomime dance	1765>1737	professor	1860
monkey	1964>1963	pantsula	1990>1989	programme	1863>1831
monkey dance	1821>1786	parabasis	1820>1812	progressive house	1991
moonwalk	1952	parking	1922	prom	1890
Moor dance	1801	partridge dance	1871>1857	promenade	1808>1778
mosh	1985	party song	1911	psychedelic trance	1984
moulinet	1820>1785	pas	1775	pullback	1957
move	1939>1932	pascola	1904>1876	punta	1951>1853
movement	1753>1701	pas d'action	1936>1902	pwe	1861>1842
mudra	1811	pas de quatre	1846>1808	quadrille	1773
mutton	1929	pas de trois	1762	quickstep	1766
myal	1868>1774	pas grave	1778>1762	quick time	1790>1707

Appendix 3: Antedatings excerpted from full-text versions

OED3 headword	Antedated from > to	Citation and source
macabre (dance)	1851>1841	'If then, by some culinary magic, he can be induced to cram his throat, rather than to cut it,—to feat himself, instead of worms,—to prefer a minuet ¹ in the Council Chamber to the Dance Macabre in the shades below,—the gorgeous anniversaries of Gog and Magog have not been celebrated in vain ¹ : Bentley's Miscellany, 9
Madison	1962>1960	'The biggest dance vogue of 1960 so far is a free-wheeling, frequently hilarious new two-step called The Madison , which in nine months has erupted from local obscurity into a national fever': Ebony, 15(9)
malagueña	1853>1810	'Tonadillas, seguidillas, boleros and tyranas are the general national songs, but there are many provincial styles, such as the Malaguena , &c. These dances though sometimes met in Spanish America, are not those generally used in society': Present State of the Spanish Colonies, 1
mambo	1948>1946	'Equally attractive is the Morales piano and the band's rumba rhythms for ' Mambo ': Billboard, 58(39)
Manipuri	1957>1911	'I was informed that at Ukrul, a large, if not the largest, Tang-khul village, they have a dance for girls only, which is very similar to the Manipuri dance—called Khubei-sei-sakpa': The Nāga Tribes of Manipur [AT]
marga	1956>1862	'What is meant, in the terminology of Hindu music, by sthāna, dharmā, and mārga , I am at a loss to say. The last is, perhaps, 'mode': Journal of the American Oriental Society, 7
marinera	1926>1911	'A further insight into its character may be obtained from the name of the kindred dance in Peru, which is called La Marinera , plainly-intimating that its origin came from over the sea, rather than from the original inhabitants of the country': Adventures in Search of a Living in Spanish-America [AT]
matachin 2	1876>1812	'One division of the city was entirely inhabited by Montezumas dancers and posture-makers; some of whom danced like those Italians whom we call Matachines ; others played various tricks by means of sticks which they balanced in many curious ways; and others had a strange manner of flying in the air': A General History and Collection of Voyages and Travels, Arranged in Systematic Order..., 4
maxixe	1914>1909	'Of that season of 1906 only the dancing was memorable. It was the year when the garish sparkle of the Maxixe spread about the European continent. Under its own name, or many others, such as the Craquette, it was this dance that swung itself upon the eye and the ear': Their Day in Court [AT]
maypole dance	1870>1717	'Soon after this, a Couple of Country Wenches, who, as they said, had lost their Maidenheads out of a Frolick, after a May-pole dance , came to me with Half-a-crown apiece in their Hands; telling me they had been ask'd Twice in the Church, and that if I did not make them Virgins against next they, they would be undone': The Censor, 2
mazurka	1854>1830	' MAZURKA a la RONDO, composed and published by the same': The

Section 6. Historical and Scholarly Lexicography and Etymology

		Harmonicon, part 1
mazy	1841>1677	'She paus'd,—and lo! a troop of Nymphs advance, / Who weave with nimble feet the mazy dance ': The Diaboliad: A Poem
modern (dance)	1933>1891	'True, we still have the monotonous soporific quadrille, as if to remind us of bygone times; but the true modern dance is the round dance, which differs from the stately mediaeval dance as a jolly rural picnic does from a formal morning call': Romantic Love and Personal Beauty: Their Development, Casual Relations, Historic... [AT]
Molly dancer	1903>1881	'The name of molly dancers was used some 46 years ago. The name contains two very significant corruptions of very common Christian names in Lancashire—Mary and Elizabeth. The two personages were respectively called Dirty Moll and Lazy Bet': Advertiser Notes and Queries, 1 [AT]
money musk	1792>1785	'And I see the fiddler through the dusk, / as he twangs the ghost of ' Money Musk! ' / The boys and girls in a double row, / Wait face to face till the magic bow': Lady's Almanac
monkey	1964>1963	'The strange awards to be presented by Chicago's Budland dance palace to the couple doing the best version of the ' Monkey, ' the city's newest dance craze': Jet (June 27)
monkey dance	1821>1786	'Contents: Monkey-dance ... One of these was called the baboon-dance, in which they imitated the baboons or apes: this, as well as the others, was distinguished by a thousand grimaces, the performers moreover now and then going upon all fours': The Voyage to the Cape of Good Hope, Towards the Antarctic Polar Circle, and Round the World...
moulinet	1820>1785	'A rigaudon cost him little in figuring, instead of a pas grave; and a balance, when a moulinet was required: the violin was not necessary to change the tune for him to begin alone a pot-pouri; and all this rendered him insupportable to the young ladies': The Critical Review: Or, Annals of Literature, 60
movement	1735>1701	'Thus, to lessen the Diversion of Dancing, consider every Movement or Gesture, apart': The Emperor Marcus Antoninus. His Conversation with Himself, 1 st ed.
myal	1868>1774	'Not long since, some of these execrable wretches in Jamaica introduced what they called the myal dance, and established a kind of society, into which they invited all they could': The History of Jamaica
Nataraja	1910>1892	'The word Chidambaram means <i>region of pure consciousness</i> , and Siva is worshiped here under his most excellent name of Nataraja , <i>lord of the dance</i> ': From Adam's Peak to Elephanta: Sketches in Ceylon and India [AT]
natya	1835>1832	'Three different kinds of dramatic representations are spoken of: first, Natya , which is properly the dramatic, being defined to be gesticulation with language; the second is Nritya, or pantomime; and the third is Uritta, which is simple dancing': An Historical Sketch of the Sanscrit Literature
nautch	1789>1750	'I am not surprised that the Asiatics laugh at us for <i>taking the trouble</i> , as they say, to dance, when, for a few rupees, we could hire pretty nautch -girls to do the whole for us; but Englishmen are fond of keeping up English customs, and may be forgiven for thus amusing themselves in a foreign land': Sketches of India: With Notes on the Seasons, Scenery, and Society of Bombay...
nayika	1948>1871	' Nayika —The heroine of a drama; the extent to which females are partakers of scenic incident, affords an interesting picture of the relations of that sex in Hindu society': A Classical Dictionary of India: Illustrative of the Mythology, Philosophy, Literature, Antiquities... [AT]
ngoma	1905>1859	'In the town of Zanzibar these ' Ngoma ' or dances were prohibited for moral reasons by the late Sayyid': The Journal of the Royal Geographical Society in London, 29
notation	1920>1845	'CHOREOGRAPHY... The art of expressing the movements of a dance by notation ': Encyclopaedia Metropolitana: Or Universal Dictionary of Knowledge...
notator	1896>1853	'Mention is here also made of Peter, a most excellent notator , and John, dictus Primarius, Thomas de Sancto Juliano, a Parisian, and others deeply skilled in the Cantus Mensurabilis': A General History of the Science and Practice of Music, 1
nritta	1835>1833	'The dramatic representations first invented, say the Hindu writers, consisted of three kinds, Natya, Nritya and Nritta , which were exhibited before the gods... Of these different modes of representation the Natya only is properly the dramatic, and defined to be—Gesticulation with Language. The Nritya is Gesticulation without Language, or Pantomime. And the Nritta is simple dancing': Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 34
nritya	1835>1792	'but most of the Indian books on this art consist accordingly of three parts, gana, vadya, nritya , or song, percussion, or dancing; the first of which includes the

		measures of poetry, the second extends to instrumental musick of all sorts, and the third includes the whole compass of theatrical representation': Asiatick Researches: Or Transactions of the Society, Instituted in Bengal..., 3
oberek	1938>1883	'At every house they dance the characteristic dances of the occasion: the Krakomiak, the Mazur, and the Oberek . The first is a very pretty and peculiar dance... the Oberek resembles a waltz danced the reverse way, and with a very pretty and characteristic figure, in which the man kneels on one knee and kisses his partner's hand': The Story of Helena Modjeska, (Madame Chlapowska) [AT]
old time (dance)	1909>1892	'Somebody sits down to the spinet, and straightway the quaint measure of the old-time dance is heard. The general lays his hand upon his heart and bows': Belhaven Tales: Crow's Nest; Una and King David [AT]
ole	1846>1845	'This charming creature—a perfect divinity on the most reduced scale—accompanies and regulates every dance with guitar or castanets, and ends with the enchanting Olé ': Revelations of Spain, in 1845, By an English Resident, 1
orchestic	1847>1808	'Dancing is one of those bodily exercises which was cultivated by the Greeks with great attention. It made a part of what the ancients called the <i>Gymnastic</i> , divided, according to* Plato, into two kinds, the <i>Orchestic</i> , which takes its name from dancing, and the <i>Palaestric</i> , so called from a Greek word which signifies wrestling': The Ancient History of the Egyptians, Carthaginians [&c.], 4, 11 th ed.
Ouled Nail	1881>1879	'Although the guide-books dissuade ladies from passing through the street where the dancing girls of the Ouled Nails lived, we constantly did so and never met with the slightest unpleasantness': An Argument for a National Bureau of Insurance Submitted to the Insurance Companies [AT]
Paduan	1880>1839	'In Alford's <i>Instructions for the lute</i> , above mentioned, there is a Paduane and a Pavane': Illustrations of Shakespeare, and of Ancient Manners
palais (de danse)	1913>1900	'The Palais de Danse is here as well, in which every dance of the world is to be exhibited': A Woman's Paris: A Handbook of Every-day Living in the French Capital [AT]
pantomime dance	1765>1737	'A Prince of Pontus, coming to Nero's court upon some business, and having seen a famous Pantomime dance with so much art, and tho' he understood nothing of what was sung, yet he was thereby able to comprehend what was meant, upon his departure desired the Emperor to make him a present of that dancer': The Method of Teaching and Studying the Belles Lettres: Or, An Introduction to Languages...
parabasis	1820>1812	'The Parabasis , or piece in which the chorus advancing further on the stage addressed the audience on the subject of the drama, the performance of it, or the tricks and absurdities of other poets...': Comedies of Aristophanes. VIZ: The Clouds, Plutus, the Frogs, the Birds, Translated into English: With Notes
partridge dance	1871>1857	'I knew they were performing what is called the ' partridge dance '; and as I had never witnessed it, I held back a while, and looked on': The Young Voyagers, Or the Boy Hunters in the North
pascola	1904>1876	Their favorite dances are the 'Venado,' the 'Coyote,' the 'Tesguin' and the ' Pascola ;' and the music, of which an idea is given at the end of this work, reveals the sprightly disposition of the people I refer to': The Republic of Mexico in 1876: A Political and Ethnographical Division of the Population, Character... [AT]
pas de quatre	1846>1808	'The <i>People's Friend</i> , a daily newspaper, printed at New York, advertised on the 25th of May last, a dancing mistress's ball, which was to display all the elegancies of the <i>pas seul</i> —the pas de quatre —and half a score of other <i>pas</i> , with a variety of <i>gavottes</i> and <i>character dances</i> ': The Sporting Magazine, Or Monthly Calendar of the Transactions of the Turf, the Chase, and Every Other Diversion, 30
pas grave	1778>1762	'to all the crawling young gentlemen of her acquaintance; and that her crawl, or as they may possibly call it, her pas grave , is far before the minuet step, with all its wavings': A Dialogue on Taste, 2 nd ed. / The Investigator: Containing the Following Tracts
paso doble	1927>1896	'There are special dances, too, like the baile Manchera, the Soleada, the Fandango, etc. Some for one person, some in which two (a man and a girl) face each other and dance a paso doble , or others like the Fandango, in which a number take part': The Land of the Castanet: Spanish Sketches [AT]
pastorale	1845>1818	'Beethoven's Pastoral Symphony is an admirable specimen or picture of pastoral life. Pastorale is also the name of a dance': An Encyclopaedia, Or Dictionary of Music ...
Paul Jones	1920>1914	'It may be like dancing the Paul Jones . The fun of the dance is the change of partners. The new one is not always better, but he's different': Sunset, 33 [AT]

Section 6. Historical and Scholarly Lexicography and Etymology

pedestal dance	1895>1880	'I used to be afraid, first, of the flying leaps from the gallery to the stage, and then the pedestal-dance seemed so terrible': <i>Lost in a Great City</i> [AT]
perigourdine	1880>1825	'Country dances, waltzes, <i>Montferrines</i> , Anglaises, and the ancient <i>Perigourdine</i> , diversified the evening's amusements, and nothing could be gayer or more animated than they were': <i>The Hermit in Italy, Or Observations on the Manner and Customs of Italy...</i> , 1
Petronella	1843>1828	''Spose then, that I have handed you down to the bottom of five-and-twenty couple at a country-dance, to the tune of Sir Roger de Coverley, Morgiana in Ireland, Petronella , or the Triumph; and, notwithstanding our having sucked a couple of oranges a-piece, we are both quite in a broth of perspiration': <i>The Mirror of Literature, Amusement, and Instruction: Containing Original Essays...</i> , 12
phrase	1925>1900	'It must not be forgotten that a waltz is written in phrases of two bars each, the lady beginning each phrase with the right, the gentleman with the left foot; as the foregoing method of starting requires but one bar, it is necessary to wait for the second bar of a phrase before beginning': <i>Dancing and Its Relations to Education and Social life: With a New Method of Instruction</i>
phrasing	1952>1916	'DIRECTIONS Old Phrasing 'Take hands and go round twice: back again, all set and turn sides: that again. Lead all in a double forward and back: that again': <i>A Book for Shakespeare Plays and Pageants</i> [Reprint 2005]
pillow dance	1909>1811	'Sir Godfrey is very facetious on these reports, and talks something about Signora Collini's qualifications for a <i>shake</i> not being equal to Miss Giroux's for the pillow-dance , but I do not comprehend his meaning': <i>The Scourge; Or Monthly Expositor, of Imposture and Folly</i> (February 1)
plait dance	1887>1876	'Perhaps the prettiest executing of this evening was the Kólâtam, or plait dance , round a maypole, to the air of 'Bonnie Dundee,' rather differently rendered from the way we are accustomed to hear it in Scotland': <i>India in 1875-76: The Visit of the Prince of Wales, a Chronicle of His Royal Highness's Journeyings in India...</i>
plantation dance	1860>1848	'Of course the great feature is Juba, the toe-and-heel Juba—Miss Lucy Long, the finest specimen of a 'nigger wench' ever seen in this country—whilst as for his ' Plantation Dance ' to use a Yankeeism, 'it beats all creations': <i>The Theatrical Times, A Weekly Magazine of Thespian Biography...</i> , 3
pole dance	1912>1819	'The pole dance in general closes the diversion of the afternoon; a dance so called from the production of a pole about ten feet high, and about four or five inches in circumference': <i>A Narrative of the Expedition to the Rivers Orinoco and Apuré in South America...</i>
polka	1843>1825	'Contains cotillions, marches, allemandes, waltzes, a polka , songs, and several hymns': Miss George Anna Reinagle: <i>Music Book for Fancy Tunes</i> [Confirmed in <i>Bibliographic Guide to Dance: 1981</i>]
polo 2	1883>1830	'Each Spanish province possesses its particular music. In Andalusia it is called Polo ; in Biscay, <i>Zorcico</i> ; in Aragon, <i>la Jota</i> ; in Galicia, <i>la Muneira</i> ; in Castille, <i>las Abbas Verdes</i> ': <i>The Harmonicon</i>
polska	1849>1823	'It is a highly amusing dance, and the eagerness with which the Norwegians hasten to join in it, when the Polsk is played, shows their extreme fondness for it': <i>The Atheneum; Or, Spirit of the English Magazines Comprehending...</i>
pose	1845>1840	'The firm <i>à plomb</i> and artistical <i>tendue</i> , the wonderful fusion of grace with agility, the beautiful poses in which male and female artist combine their figures with perfectly statuesque effects, the tip-toe flights across the stage ... displayed respectively by the two Queens of Art': <i>The London Magazine, Charivari, and Courier des Dames...</i>
position	1778>1735	'Of the CLOSE beating before and falling behind in the third Position , upright Spring changing to the same before, and COUPEE to a Measure': <i>The Art of Dancing Explained by Reading and Figures: Whereby the Manner of Performing the Steps is Made Easy...</i>
prisiadka	1938>1887	'The count took the landlord by the throat, and ordered him to dance the prisiadka . The merchant refused': <i>A Russian Proprietor and Other Stories</i> [AT]
programme	1863>1831	'"May I have a dance?" he asked. Effie hesitated for an instant. George Duff's heart stood still. "Number five," said Effie. "That is the Lancers." "Thank you", answered Captain Verschoyle, rapidly inscribing his initials on her programme , and then departing': <i>Ballou's Monthly Magazine</i> , 53
promenade	1808>1778	'5 th . The Promenade , half round, to the right. - - - 8 bars': <i>The Gentleman's and London Magazine: Or Monthly Chronologer, 1741-1794</i>
punta	1951>1853	'Towards the end of the festivity we were entertained by the introduction of the ' punta ', a dance performed only by a single pair, and being a great favourite among the negroes and zamboes, but now almost proscribed in refined circles,—which, by the bye, from its frivolous tendency, is not to be regretted':

		Narrative of the Voyage of H. M. S. Herald During the Years 1845-51
pwe	1861>1842	‘The <i>Maulmain Chronicle</i> , of October 13th, states that Rangoon was full of troops, and that the king and his sons were winning golden opinions by their affability, and liberal allowance of pwais , dances, fighting, wresting, &c.’: The Asiatic Journal and Monthly Register for British and Foreign India, China, and Australasia, 37 (New Series)
quick time	1790>1707	‘Nonupla, a quick time in Musick peculiar to Gigs and such like; having nine Crotchets between Bar and Bar’: Glossographia Anglicana Nova: Or, A Dictionary, Interpreting Such Hard Words...

Appendix 4: Antedatings excerpted from text snippets

OED3 headword	Antedated from > to	Quotation and source
Macarena	1995>1993	‘Some feel that when the innkeeper was alive, it was usually called macarena ; others are of the view that it has been known as <i>laberinto</i> since the beginning’: Studies in Dance History, 4(1)
makossa	1985>1976	‘In the dance called makossa , a shortened form of the expression <i>kosa la ngando</i> (literally, undressing of the dance), the gestures and movements actually’: Cultural Policy in the United Republic of Cameroon
Mess Around	1946>1927	‘That dance called mess around ; words and melody by Billy V. Ewing. (C) 1 e. May 8, 1926; E 640603; Clarence Williams music pub. co., inc.; New York’: Catalog of Copyright Entries, part 3, 21(1)
mine-dance	1939>1931	‘THE MARIMBA PLAYERS AT THE KLEENFONTIA MINE DANCE FESTIVALS More than twelve thousand blacks dance in the compound’: Africa from Port to Port
move	1939>1932	‘He looked at the couple gliding past and put up his left hand. Her hand met his and he grasped it warmly. He started to make a move and stopped. ‘That’s not right,’ he said. ‘Now wait for the time’, she instructed him’: Never Enough: A Novel
nautch dance	1825>1800	‘Mr. Lazenby begged Emma to give him only three things,—the Persian Air, the Palanquin-bearer’s Song, and the Nautch Dance , which he had got written down at Futtighur—all of which were duly performed, to the infinite delight of Messrs’: Merton, and the Sutherlands
nayaka	1967>1933	‘His nayaka (dancing master) had a character without blemish, and only people who were without vanity and clean of mind were permitted to witness the dance’: The Land and the Lingam
New Beat	1988>1967	‘These days even Electronic Music is turning out to mean Rock with the amplification way up ... The new beat is not the old expressive ‘rubato’ pulse of classical-romantic music or the flexible swinging beat of the jazz tradition’: Evergreen Review, 11(45)
obertas	1889>1877	‘‘What is an Obertas ?’ ‘Oh, one of the Polish dances. Do you remember, Franz, the Obertas that Ladislas and I danced one night at Carlsbad?’: Blue Roses; Or, Helen Malinofska’s Marriage, 2 nd ed.
Odissi	1965>1881	‘they have got Rs. 3000 for the development of Odissi dance, Rs. 2000 for survey of Odissi drama’: Lok Sabha Debates
one step	1911>1909	‘They were dancing the one-step . The music was heavenly. The swish of her silken skirt was divine. The fragrance of the roses upon her bosom was really intoxicating.’, Current opinion, 47
Orissi	1960>1947	‘Glimpses of India— Orissi Dance’: Indian and Foreign Review, 5
ork	1936>1935	‘ANDY WONG of the Chinatown Knights Ork which played for the Cheng Sen Club dance in Sacramento, liked the town so much that he stayed over for two more nights... one certain Sacramento MISS waited in vain for her swain’: Chinese Digest: Official Organ of the Chinese Cultural Society of America, 1-2
pantsula	1990>1989	‘There has been the popular pantsula dancing about which one anti-pantsula lady said: ‘These guys really do their thing. Just take a look at how they shake their limbs. You would think they were made of jelly’: Pace: Process & Control Engineering (July)
pas d’action	1936>1902	‘A ‘ Pas d’action ’ and ‘Polonaise’’: Musical Standard, 18
passillo	1885>1882	‘and the piano, we had several good ‘bambucas’ played, and ‘ passillos ,’ and two of the children danced’: A Year in the Andes; Or, A Lady’s Adventures in Bogotá
pogo	1978>1953	‘Highlights of the week were an all campus pep rally, a Pogo Dance , and the individual campaigns by prospective class officers’: The Arrow of Pi Beta Phi, 69, 3 rd ed.

Section 6. Historical and Scholarly Lexicography and Etymology

pony	1962>1961	‘Some of the new social dances, however, such as the Madison, Hop, Pachanga, and the Pony , temper and modify this physical closeness in a manner appropriate to any group context’: The Girl Delinquent and the Male Street Corner Gang Report
production number	1926>1924	‘The man up to Goebel's told us the song was OK and he liked it but it was more of a production number than anything else and ought to go in a show like the Follies but they won't be in NY much longer and what we ought to do is hold it till next spring’: How to Write Short Stories (with Samples)